

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

TAMARA MOORE, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

MARS PETCARE US, INC., et al.,

Defendants.

Case No. 16-cv-07001-MMC

**AMENDED\***  
**ORDER GRANTING IN PART AND**  
**DENYING IN PART PLAINTIFFS'**  
**ADMINISTRATIVE MOTIONS TO**  
**SEAL; DIRECTIONS TO PLAINTIFFS**

Before the Court are four Administrative Motions, filed January 17, 2024 (Doc. Nos. 376, 379, 381, 383), whereby plaintiffs seek to file under seal the following materials, which, plaintiffs state, have been designated as confidential by other parties: (1) portions of "Plaintiffs' Supplemental Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Its Motion for Class Certification Against Defendant Royal Canin U.S.A., Inc.," "Plaintiffs' Supplemental Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Its Motion for Class Certification Against Defendant Mars Petcare US, Inc.," and "Plaintiffs' Supplemental Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Its Motion for Class Certification Against Defendant Hills Pet Nutrition, Inc." ("Supplemental Motions"); and (2) various exhibits attached to the "Declaration of Edward J. Coyne III in Support of Plaintiffs' Supplemental Memoranda of Point and Authorities in Support of Its Motions for Class Certification Against Defendants" ("Coyne Declaration"). Responses to the Administrative Motions have been filed by non-parties Banfield and PetSmart LLC and defendants Hills Pet Nutrition ("Hills"), Royal Canin U.S.A., Inc. ("Royal Canin"), and Mars Petcare US, Inc ("Mars").

The Court having read and considered the above-referenced submissions, the

---

\* The sole amendment is to correct the list of exhibits in Paragraph 3.b.

Administrative Motions are hereby GRANTED in part and DENIED in part as follows:

1. To the extent the Administrative Motions (Doc. Nos. 379, 381, 383) seek leave to file under seal portions of the Supplemental Motions, the Administrative Motions are, as set forth below, GRANTED in part and DENIED in part.

a. The Administrative Motion (Doc. No. 379) as to “Plaintiffs’ Supplemental Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Its Motion for Class Certification Against Defendant Hills Pet Nutrition, Inc.,” is GRANTED as to the following:

- (1) the reference to Ex. 64 on page 8 (lines 13-16)
- (2) the reference to Ex. 65 on page 8 (lines 16-18)
- (3) the reference to Ex. 72 on page 16 at footnote 17 (lines 27-28)
- (4) the reference to Ex. 89 on page 14 (lines 11-14)
- (5) the reference to Ex. 92 on page 15 (lines 13-14)
- (6) the reference to Ex. 93 on page 15 (lines 17-19) and page 16 (lines 10-12)
- (7) the reference to Ex. 96 on page 15 (lines 23-24)
- (8) the reference to Ex. 66 on page 8 (lines 19-20).

In all other respects, the Administrative Motion is DENIED as to portions of “Plaintiffs’ Supplemental Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Its Motion for Class Certification Against Defendant Hills Pet Nutrition, Inc.,” good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

b. The Administrative Motion (Doc. No. 381) as to “Plaintiffs’ Supplemental Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Its Motion for Class Certification Against Defendant Royal Canin U.S.A., Inc.” is GRANTED as to the following:

- (1) the percentage between “approximately” and “of PPF” on page 11, line 4
- (2) the percentage between “approximately” and “of RC sales” on page 11,

line 6

(3) the percentage between “in 2017” and “of RC’s” on page 11, line 11

(4) the percentage between “made up” and “of sales” on page 11, line 13

(5) the percentage between “approximately” and “of RC VD sales” on page 15, line 25

(6) the percentage after “alone making up” on page 15, line 25

(7) the number after “from approximately” on page 15, line 26

(8) the number between “approximately” and “in 2017” on page 15, line 27.

In all other respects, the Administrative Motion is DENIED as to portions of “Plaintiffs’ Supplemental Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Its Motion for Class Certification Against Defendant Royal Canin U.S.A., Inc.,” good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

c. The Administrative Motion (Doc. No. 383) as to “Plaintiffs’ Supplemental Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Its Motion for Class Certification Against Defendant Mars Petcare US, Inc.” is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) number between “lams was selling approximately” and “worth of PPF” on page 2, line 19.

In all other respects, the Administrative Motion is DENIED as to portions of “Plaintiffs’ Supplemental Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Its Motion for Class Certification Against Defendant Mars Petcare US, Inc.,” good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

2. To the extent the Administrative Motion (Doc. No. 376) seeks leave to file under seal exhibits attached to the Coyne Declaration, the Administrative Motion is, as set forth below, GRANTED in part and DENIED in part.

a. As to Exhibits 11, 15, 17, 30, 37, 65, 89, 92, 96, 134, 145, 157, the

Administrative Motion is GRANTED.

b. As to Exhibit 9, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) pages Royal Canin\_121710 through Royal Canin\_121714

(2) pages Royal Canin\_121722 through Royal Canin\_121727

(3) pages Royal Canin\_121732 through Royal Canin\_121733.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 9, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

c. As to Exhibit 12, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) page Royal Canin\_123961

(2) all bullets except for the bullet starting with “Experiences in Vet school” on page Royal Canin\_123963

(3) page Royal Canin\_123981 through the end of the exhibit.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 12, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

d. As to Exhibit 19, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) pages 6, 8, and 10<sup>†</sup>

(2) the “objectives” box, “strategy” box, and the email address identified in the “approval process” on page 12.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 19, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

e. As to Exhibit 22, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) the second page of the exhibit (slide 3)

(2) all text except for row “e” on the third page of the exhibit (slide 5)

---

<sup>†</sup> The pages used in this Order for Exhibits 19, 64, 72, and 73 are the pages described by Hills as “pdf p.” or “pdf pp.” (See Doc. 387-2.)

(3) the final page of the exhibit (slide 8).

As to all other portions of Exhibit 22, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

f. As to Exhibit 64, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) pages 5 and 17 through 21

(2) the “contextual advertising” and “promoted content” bullets on page 6.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 64, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

g. As to Exhibit 66, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) page 182, line 5 through page 185, line 12

(2) page 185, line 22 through page 186, line 23

(3) page 187, lines 9 through 22

(4) page 188, lines 13 through 20

(5) page 189, lines 16 through 19

(6) page 190, lines 5 through 8.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 66, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

h. As to Exhibit 69, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) all text starting at the third email on page Royal Canin\_050871 through end of the exhibit.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 69, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

i. As to Exhibit 71, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) the second email of the chain on page Royal Canin\_223357

(2) from the beginning of page Royal Canin\_223358 until the email from Leah Wilkinson

(3) the phone number in the email signature on page Royal Canin\_223359. As to all other portions of Exhibit 71, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

j. As to Exhibit 72, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) page 5

(2) the list of sources from which the data was compiled that is included under the images on pages 6 through 9

(3) pages 11 through 12, 18, 20 through 21, 23 through 24, 31, 33, 36, and 38.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 72, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

k. As to Exhibit 73, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) pages 12 through 24, and 28 through 31.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 73, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

l. As to Exhibit 75, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) all content except for the box titled "Marketing" on page Royal Canin\_193836

(2) all content except for the slide heading on page Royal Canin\_193841

(3) all text below the row titled "(e)KAM" on page Royal Canin\_193843.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 75, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

1 m. As to Exhibit 93, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

2 (1) all terms under “Merchandising and Sale of Prescription Diet Products”  
3 on pages 1 through 2

4 (2) all terms under “Education and Promotion” and “Incentives” on pages 2  
5 through 4

6 (3) the names and addresses under “In the case of PETsMART”

7 and “In the case of MMI” on page 6

8 (4) the signatures under “Hill’s Pet Nutrition, Inc.,” “Medical Management,”  
9 and “PETsMART, Inc.” on page 7.

10 As to all other portions of Exhibit 93, the Administrative Motion is DENIED,  
11 good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating  
12 parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

13 n. As to Exhibit 100, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the  
14 following:

15 (1) all text in the exhibit except for paragraph 3.

16 As to all other portions of Exhibit 100, the Administrative Motion is DENIED,  
17 good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating  
18 parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

19 o. As to Exhibit 101, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the  
20 following:

21 (1) the second paragraph of the first email and the phone numbers in email  
22 signatures on page Royal Canin\_168882

23 (2) the phone numbers in the email signatures on page Royal  
24 Canin\_168883.

25 As to all other portions of Exhibit 101, the Administrative Motion is DENIED,  
26 good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating  
27 parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

28 p. As to Exhibit 107, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the

1 following:

2 (1) page Royal Canin\_284020 and page Royal Canin\_284024

3 (2) all text on page Royal Canin\_284028 except for:

4 a. "Leading Global Pet Specialty Retailer" and the text under that  
5 heading

6 b. "Second Largest Pet Specialty Retailer" and text under that heading.

7 As to all other portions of Exhibit 107, the Administrative Motion is DENIED,  
8 good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating  
9 parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

10 q. As to Exhibit 111, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the  
11 following:

12 (1) on page Royal Canin\_038674:

13 a. the name and email on the "To:" line in the "May 26 8:57 AM" email

14 b. the name and email on the "From:" line in the "May 25 6:11 PM"  
15 email

16 c. the name and email on the "From:" line in the "May 22 9:59 PM"  
17 email

18 (2) on page Royal Canin\_038675:

19 a. the name and email on the "From: line" in the "May 22 12:17 AM"  
20 email

21 b. the "To:" line in the "May 22 7:10 AM" email.

22 As to all other portions of Exhibit 111, the Administrative Motion is DENIED,  
23 good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating  
24 parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

25 r. As to Exhibit 117, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the  
26 following:

27 (1) page Royal Canin\_160935

28 (2) all text and graphics except the slide heading ("Cash Impact of the Big



Four”) and the words “Top 4 Impact,” “Chewy & PetSmart,” “Petco,” and “Amazon” on page Royal Canin\_160937.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 117, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

s. As to Exhibit 127, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) all text except “Royal Canin needs to renew its SPT super premium business model” through “right product for each cat or dog” on page Royal Canin\_174171

(2) pages Royal Canin\_174172 through Royal Canin\_174174.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 127, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

t. As to Exhibit 129, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) pages Royal Canin\_173411; Royal Canin\_173413 through Royal Canin\_173414; Royal Canin\_173419 through Royal Canin\_173420; and Royal Canin\_173422

(2) the pie chart on page Royal Canin\_173427

(3) pages Royal Canin\_173431; Royal Canin\_173433; Royal Canin\_173435; Royal Canin\_173445 through Royal Canin\_173447; Royal Canin\_173451; Royal Canin\_173457; and Royal Canin\_173498.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 129, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

u. As to Exhibit 130, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) the text after “through this crisis” through the end of page Royal Canin\_205515

(2) the text after “chat with a vet 24/7” through the end of page Royal Canin\_205516

(3) pages Royal Canin\_205517 through Royal Canin\_205519

(4) pages Royal Canin\_205521 through Royal Canin\_205528.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 130, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

v. As to Exhibit 132, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) pages BM037815 through BM037816; BM037820 through BM037826; BM037829 through BM037839; BM037841 through BM037844; BM037847 through BM037848; BM037850 through BM037882; BM037884; and BM037886 through BM037887.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 132, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

w. As to Exhibit 133, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) pages BM000170; BM000174; BM000186 through BM000193; and BM000200 through BM000202.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 133, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

x. As to Exhibit 137, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) pages Royal Canin\_091470; Royal Canin\_091473; Royal

1 Canin\_091500 through Royal Canin\_091502; and Royal Canin\_091517.  
 2 As to all other portions of Exhibit 137, the Administrative Motion is DENIED,  
 3 good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating  
 4 parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

5 y. As to Exhibit 138, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the  
 6 following:

- 7 (1) pages Royal Canin\_163896 through Royal Canin\_163897; Royal  
 8 Canin\_163900 through Royal Canin\_163901; and Royal Canin\_163911  
 9 (2) all content below the slide heading, except for "Prescription Pad" and  
 10 the graph on page Royal Canin\_163912  
 11 (3) page Royal Canin\_163933.

12 As to all other portions of Exhibit 138, the Administrative Motion is DENIED,  
 13 good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating  
 14 parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

15 z. As to Exhibit 139, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the  
 16 following:

- 17 (1) page Royal Canin\_009616  
 18 (2) the text before "From: Zuncic, Neil" on page Royal Canin\_009617  
 19 (3) page Royal Canin\_009618  
 20 (4) the phone number in the email signature on page Royal Canin\_009619  
 21 (5) pages Royal Canin\_009620 through Royal Canin\_009623.

22 As to all other portions of Exhibit 139, the Administrative Motion is DENIED,  
 23 good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating  
 24 parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

25 aa. As to Exhibit 140, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the  
 26 following:

- 27 (1) pages Royal Canin\_321350, Royal Canin\_321353, and Royal  
 28 Canin\_321372.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 140, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

bb. As to Exhibit 141, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) page Royal Canin\_285880

(2) all text except for “our top two SPT customers, PetSmart & Petco, together constitutes a VERY large portion of the [sic] our business” on page Royal Canin\_285881

(3) pages Royal Canin\_285882 through Royal Canin\_285883.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 141, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

cc. As to Exhibit 142, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) pages Royal Canin\_152408 through Royal Canin\_152409

(2) pages Royal Canin\_152411 through Royal Canin\_152414

(3) all text except that which is highlighted pink in the exhibit copy on page Royal Canin\_152417

(4) page Royal Canin\_152420 through the end of the exhibit.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 142, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

dd. As to Exhibit 143, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) all text before “Research Results Summary,” the text in the first bullet below “Market Size/Characteristics,” and the text after the second bullet below “Market Size/Characteristics” on page Mars025956

(2) page Mars025957.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 143, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

ee. As to Exhibit 144, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) page Mars011521

(2) all text except “WHAT’S in it for you & your shoppers?” and “Create a ‘Store within a Store Rx Destination [sic]” on page Mars011522

(3) page Mars011523.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 144, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

ff. As to Exhibit 146, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED for the following: (1) page 19, line 24 through page 20, line 22.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 146, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

gg. As to Exhibit 149, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) the number between “campaign at” and “The updated” on page BM050894

(2) the phone number in the email signature of the second email on page BM050894

(3) the number between “at the cost of” and “for all of 2021” on page BM050895

(4) the phone numbers in the email signature on page BM050895.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 149, the Administrative Motion is DENIED,

1 good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating  
2 parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

3 hh. As to Exhibit 150, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the  
4 following:

5 (1) the "From" line and the customer name in the second email on page  
6 BM000482.

7 As to all other portions of Exhibit 150, the Administrative Motion is DENIED,  
8 good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating  
9 parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

10 ii. As to Exhibit 151, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the  
11 following:

12 (1) page Royal Canin\_047154

13 (2) the text before "From: Lovern, Cindy" and after "us and our brand" on  
14 page Royal Canin\_047155

15 (3) pages Royal Canin\_047156 through Royal Canin\_047157.

16 As to all other portions of Exhibit 151, the Administrative Motion is DENIED,  
17 good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating  
18 parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

19 jj. As to Exhibit 152, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the  
20 following:

21 (1) the text before "Continued growth of EComm" and after "over the next  
22 few years" on page Royal Canin\_231326

23 (2) page Royal Canin\_231327 through the end of the exhibit.

24 As to all other portions of Exhibit 152, the Administrative Motion is DENIED,  
25 good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating  
26 parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

27 kk. As to Exhibit 154, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the  
28 following:

(1) page Royal Canin\_243178 through Royal Canin\_243184

(2) the text before “a clinic wrote a letter” and after “they seemed to have stopped” on page Royal Canin\_243185

(3) page Royal Canin\_243186 through Royal Canin\_243188

(4) the text before “I said ‘this letter’” and after “be fined” on page Royal Canin\_243189

(5) page Royal Canin\_243190.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 154, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

II. As to Exhibit 155, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) the text before “With the transformation of the pet owner” and after “(getting zero margin)” on page Royal Canin\_019390

(2) page Royal Canin\_019391 through Royal Canin\_019394.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 155, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

mm. As to Exhibit 156, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) pages Royal Canin\_057998 through Royal Canin\_057999

(2) all text except that which is highlighted pink in the exhibit copy on page Royal Canin\_057800

(3) page Royal Canin\_057801.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 156, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

nn. As to Exhibit 160, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the

1 following:

2 (1) the text after “virtually all prescription pet food competitors” on page  
3 Mars000007

4 (2) page Mars000008 through the end of the exhibit.

5 As to all other portions of Exhibit 160, the Administrative Motion is DENIED,  
6 good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating  
7 parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

8 oo. As to Exhibit 161, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the  
9 following:

10 (1) the text below the “SUBJECT” line and above the “Background” heading  
11 on page Mars021371.

12 As to all other portions of Exhibit 161, the Administrative Motion is DENIED,  
13 good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating  
14 parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

15 pp. As to Exhibit 164, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the  
16 following:

17 (1) the phone numbers in the email signatures, name, and email address of  
18 the veterinarian on page Royal Canin\_022828.

19 As to all other portions of Exhibit 164, the Administrative Motion is DENIED,  
20 good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating  
21 parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

22 qq. As to Exhibit 166, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the  
23 following:

24 (1) the text above “Q2 2013 Client Promotion,” between “Q2 2013 Client  
25 Promotion” and “Recommendations by Veterinarian,” and after “reverse  
26 side” on page Royal Canin\_067703.

27 As to all other portions of Exhibit 166, the Administrative Motion is DENIED,  
28 good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating



parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

rr. As to Exhibit 167, the Administrative Motion is GRANTED as to the following:

(1) all text except for the pie chart in the bottom-right corner of the slide on the second page of the exhibit.

As to all other portions of Exhibit 167, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, good cause for their sealing not having been shown or the designating parties not having sought to have those other portions sealed.

ss. As to Exhibits 1, 10, 18, 20, 23-24, 33, 67-68, 70, 74, 84-88, 90-91, 94-95, 102-04, 106, 108, 115-16, 123-24, 128, 131, 136 and 147, the Administrative Motion is DENIED, the designating parties not having sought to have those exhibits sealed.


3. Plaintiffs are hereby DIRECTED to file in the public record, no later than fourteen days from the date of this order:

a. revised redacted versions of the Supplemental Motions; and

b. revised redacted versions of Exhibits 9, 12, 19, 22, 64, 66, 69, 71-73, 75, 93, 100-01, 107, 111, 117, 127, 129-130, 132-33, 137-44, 146, 149-52, 154-56, 160-61, 164, 166-67 to the Coyne Declaration.

**IT IS SO ORDERED.**

Dated: March 21, 2024

  
MAXINE M. CHESNEY  
United States District Judge